

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

The Right Reverend Charles G. vonRosenberg, individually and in his capacity as the former Provisional Bishop of The Episcopal Church in South Carolina and The Right Reverend Gladstone B. Adams, III, individually and in his capacity as the Provisional Bishop of The Episcopal Church in South Carolina,

Plaintiffs,

The Episcopal Church,

Plaintiff in Intervention

vs.

The Right Reverend Mark J. Lawrence, et al.

Defendants.

**CIVIL ACTION NUMBER:
2:13-cv-00587-RMG**

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR
SUMMARY JUDGMENT ON
GENERICNESS**

Defendants, The Rt. Rev. Mark J. Lawrence, The Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese of South Carolina; and The Trustees of the Protestant Episcopal Church of South Carolina; Church of The Cross, Inc. and Church of the Cross Declaration of Trust, The Church of Our Saviour, of the Diocese of South Carolina, The Protestant Episcopal Church, of the Parish of Saint Philip, in Charleston South Carolina, The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish of Saint Michael in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust, The Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. Helena and the Parish Church of St. Helena Trust, Trinity Episcopal Church, St. David's Church, Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. John's Charleston County, Vestry

and Church Wardens of St. Jude's Church of Walterboro, The Vestries and Churchwardens of the Parish of St. Andrew; Holy Trinity, Grahamville; St. Alban's Chapel, The Citadel; St. John's Episcopal, Charleston; St. Andrew's Mission; All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; St. Bartholomews Episcopal Church; The Church of the Holy Cross; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Parish of St. Matthew; The Church of the Holy Apostles; St. James Anglican Church; St. Barnabas' Church; Church of the Ascension; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Orangeburg; Historic Church of the Epiphany, St. Johns, Berkeley; Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church; Church Of The Holy Comforter; St. Matthias Episcopal Church, Inc.; St. Matthews Church; Christ Episcopal Church, Mars Bluff Community, Florence County, South Carolina; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis; Church Of The Redeemer; Holy Trinity Episcopal Church; The Church Of The Good Shepherd, Charleston, SC; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Bennettsville, Inc.; St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.; The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro; The Church Of The Resurrection, Surfside; The Protestant Episcopal Church, Of The Parish Of St. Philip, In Charleston, In The State of South Carolina; The Vestry and Wardens Of St. Paul's Church, Summerville; St. Timothy's, Cane Bay; Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach; Vestry and Church-Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of Christ Church; St. Luke's Church; Grace Parish, North Myrtle Beach; Christ the King, Waccamaw; The Vestry and Church Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of Prince George Winyah; St. John's Episcopal Church of Florence, S.C.; Church of the Advent, Marion; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Conway; The Well Ministries; and Church of the Holy Cross, Sullivan's Island (collectively "Defendants") respectfully moves for summary judgment under Rule 56 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure against Plaintiffs, The Episcopal Church, The Episcopal Church in South Carolina, The Right Reverend Charles G. vonRosenberg and The Right Reverend Gladstone B. Adams, III, on the

grounds that there are no disputed issues of material fact and that the cause of action in the Second Amended Complaint-in-Intervention and Third Amended Complaint should be decided as a matter of law, as detailed in Defendants' Memorandum of law in support on this motion.

December 7, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

/s/C. Alan Runyan
C. Alan Runyan, Esq.
Andrew S. Platte, Esq.
RUNYAN & PLATTE, LLC
2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239
Beaufort, SC 2902
(843) 473-6800

/s/ Henrietta U. Golding
Henrietta U. Golding, Esq.
McNAIR LAW FIRM
P.O. Box 336
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578
(843) 444-1107

/s/ Lance A. Lawson
Lance A. Lawson
McNAIR LAW FIRM
Bank of American Plaza
101 South Tryon Street, Suite 2610
Charlotte, NC 28280

C. Mitchell Brown, Esq.
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
(803) 255-9595

Charles H. Williams, Esq.
WILLIAMS & WILLIAMS
P.O. Box 1084
Orangeburg, SC 29116-1084

(803) 534-5218

David Cox, Esq.
BARNWELL WHALEY PATTERSON & HELMS, LLC
288 Meeting Street, Suite 200
Charleston, SC 29401
(843) 577-7700

The Rt. Rev. Mark J. Lawrence, The Protestant Episcopal Church In The Diocese of South Carolina; and The Trustees of the Protestant Episcopal Church of South Carolina,

/s/ C. Alan Runyan

C. Alan Runyan, Esq.
Andrew S. Platte, Esq.
RUNYAN & PLATTE, LLC
2015 Boundary Street, Suite 239
Beaufort, SC 2902
(843)-473-6800

Church of The Cross, Inc. and Church of the Cross Declaration of Trust, The Church of Our Saviour, of the Diocese of South Carolina, The Protestant Episcopal Church, of the Parish of Saint Philip, in Charleston South Carolina, The Protestant Episcopal Church, The Parish of Saint Michael in Charleston, in the State of South Carolina and St. Michael's Church Declaration of Trust, The Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. Helena and the Parish Church of St. Helena Trust, Trinity Episcopal Church, Edisto Island, St. David's Church, Vestry and Church Wardens of the Episcopal Church of the Parish of St. John's Charleston County, Vestry and Church Wardens of St. Jude's Church of Walterboro, The Vestries and Churchwardens of the Parish of St. Andrew, Old Saint Andrews Parish Church; Holy Trinity, Grahamville; St. Alban's Chapel, The Citadel; St. John's Episcopal, Charleston; St. Andrew's Mission

/s/ C. Pierce Campbell

C. Pierce Campbell, Esq.
TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM & LANEY
319 South Irby Street, P.O. Box 5478
Florence, SC 29501
(843) 662-9008

All Saints Protestant Episcopal Church, Inc.; St. Bartholomews Episcopal Church; The Church of the Holy Cross; The Vestry and Church Wardens of The Parish of St. Matthew; The Church of the Holy Apostles; St. James Anglican Church; St. Barnabas' Church; Church of the Ascension; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Orangeburg; Historic Church of the Epiphany, St. Johns, Berkeley

/s/ I. Keith McCarty

I. Keith McCarty, Esq.
McCARTY LAW FIRM, LLC
P.O. Box 30055
Charleston, SC 29417
(843) 793-1272
Christ St. Paul's Episcopal Church

/s/ John E. Cuttino

John E. Cuttino, Esq.
GALLIVAN, WHITE & BOYD, P.A.
1201 Main Street, Suite 1200
Post Office Box 7368 (29202)
Columbia, South Carolina 29201
(803) 724-1714
Church Of The Holy Comforter; St. Matthias Episcopal Church, Inc.; St. Matthews Church; Christ Episcopal Church, Mars Bluff Community, Florence County, South Carolina; Trinity Episcopal Church, Pinopolis

/s/ C. Pierce Campbell

C. Pierce Campbell, Esq.
TURNER, PADGET, GRAHAM & LANEY
319 South Irby Street, P.O. Box 5478
Florence, SC 29501
(843) 662-9008

Robert R. Horger, Esq.
HORGER, BARNWELL & REID, LLP
P.O. Drawer 329
1459 Amelia Street
Orangeburg, SC 29115
(803) 531-3000
Church Of The Redeemer

/s/ William A. Scott

William A. Scott, Esq.
PEDERSEN & SCOTT, PC

775 St. Andrews Blvd.
Charleston, SC 29407
(843) 556-5656
Holy Trinity Episcopal Church

/s/ John Furman Wall
John Furman Wall, Esq.
140 Wando Reach Court
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464
(843) 408-3433

and

Henry P. Wall, Esq.
151 Meeting Street / Sixth Floor
Post Office Box 6110
Columbia, SC 29260
(803) 252-7693

The Church Of The Good Shepherd, Charleston, SC

/s/ Harry R. Easterling, Jr.
Harry R. Easterling, Jr., Esq.
EASTERLING LAW FIRM, PC
120 North Liberty Street
Post Office Box 611
Bennettsville, South Carolina 29512
843-454-1711
*St. David's Church; St. Paul's Episcopal Church of
Bennettsville, Inc.*

/s/ Mark V. Evans
Mark V. Evans, Esq.
147 Wappoo Creek Drive., Ste. 202
Charleston, SC 29412
(843) 762-6640
St. James' Church, James Island, S.C.

/s/ David B. Marvel
David B. Marvel, Esq.
DAVID B. MARVEL, LLC
P.O. Box 22734
Charleston, SC 29413
(843) 853-4877

and

David L. DeVane, Esq.
110 N. Main Street
Summerville, SC 29483
(843) 285-7100
The Church of St. Luke and St. Paul, Radcliffeboro

/s/ William A. Bryan
William A. Bryan, Esq.
BRYAN & HAAR
P.O. Box 14860
Surfside Beach, SC 29587
(843) 238-3461
The Church Of The Resurrection, Surfside

/s/ P. Brandt Shelbourne
P. Brandt Shelbourne, Esq.
SHELBOURNE LAW FIRM
131 E. Richardson Avenue
Summerville, SC 29483
(843) 871-2210
*The Vestry and Wardens Of St. Paul's Church, Summerville;
St. Timothy's, Cane Bay*

/s/ Susan MacDonald
Susan MacDonald, Esq.
Jim Lehman, Esq.
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP
BNC Bank Corporate Center, Suite 300
3751 Robert M. Grissom Parkway
Myrtle Beach, SC 29577
(843) 448-3500

And

/s/ Andrew M. Connor
Andrew M. Connor, Esq.
NELSON, MULLINS, RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP
Liberty Center, Suite 600
151 Meeting Street
Charleston, SC 29401-2239
(843) 853-5200

/s/ J. Andrew Yoho
Paul E. Sperry
J. Andrew Yoho

CARLOCK, COPELAND & STAIR, LLP
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400
Charleston, SC 29401
(843)727-0307
Trinity Church of Myrtle Beach

/s/ Allan P. Sloan, III
Allan P. Sloan, III, Esq.
Joseph C. Wilson IV, Esq.
PIERCE, SLOAN, WILSON, KENNEDY & EARLY, LLC
321 East Bay Street; P.O. Box 22437
Charleston, SC 29413
(843) 722-7733
*Vestry and Church-Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of
The Parish Of Christ Church*

/s/ Henrietta U. Golding
Henrietta U. Golding, Esq.
McNAIR LAW FIRM
P.O. Box 336
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578
(843) 444-1107
St. Luke's Church; Grace Parish, North Myrtle Beach

/s/ Harry A. Oxner
Harry A. Oxner, Esq.
OXNER & STACY
235 Church Street
Georgetown, SC 29440
(843) 527-8020
*Christ the King, Waccamaw; The Vestry and Church
Wardens Of The Episcopal Church Of The Parish Of Prince
George Winyah*

/s/ Lawrence B. Orr
Lawrence B. Orr, Esq.
ORR, ELMORE & ERVIN
504 South Coit Street, P.O. Box 2527
Florence, SC 29503-2527
(843) 667-6613

and

Saunders M. Bridges, Jr., Esq.
AIKEN BRIDGES ELLIOTT TYLER & SALEEBY, PA
181 E. Evans Street, Suite 409

Post Office Drawer 1931
Florence, SC 29503
(843) 669-8787
St. John's Episcopal Church of Florence, S.C.

/s/ Lawrence B. Orr
Lawrence B. Orr, Esq.
ORR, ELMORE & ERVIN
504 South Coit Street, P.O. Box 2527
Florence, SC 29503-2527
(843) 667-6613
Church of the Advent, Marion

/s/ Robert S. Shelton
Robert S. Shelton, Esq.
THE BELLAMY LAW FIRM
1000 29th Avenue
Myrtle Beach, SC 29577
(843) 448-2400
St. Paul's Episcopal Church of Conway

/s/ Karolan Ohanesian
Karolan Ohanesian, Esq.
OHANESIAN & OHANESIAN
Post Office Box 2433
Myrtle Beach, SC 29578
(843) 626-7193
The Well Ministries

/s/ Ryan A. Earhart
Ryan A. Earhart, Esq.
EARHART OVERSTREET LLC
P.O. Box 22528
Charleston, SC 29413
(843)-972-9400

And

Robert A. Kerr, Esq.
MOORE & VAN ALLEN
78 Wentworth Street
Charleston, SC 29401
Church of the Holy Cross, Sullivan's Island